

Regular Meeting
November 26, 2012

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE CASA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION HELD ON MONDAY, NOVEMBER 26, 2012 AT 6:00 P.M. IN CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 510 E. FLORENCE BOULEVARD, CASA GRANDE, ARIZONA.

I. Call to Order & Introductions:

Chairwoman Abdallah called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

Members Present

Abdallah, Susan
Blatt, David
Goff, Warren
Jantz, Marge
Poor, Thomas
Trulove, Clara

Absent

Dunley, Kathleen
Hodson, Kenneth

City Staff Present

Carl Metz, City Planner
Laura Blakeman, City Planner
Linda Harris, Development Center Secretary

II. Approval of Minutes:

A. Regular Meeting-October 22, 2012

Co-chairwoman Jantz made the motion to approve the minutes for October 22, 2012. Motion was seconded by Member Blatt. Motion passed 6-0.

III. Old Business:

A. "Original Townsite" Plaque project update

Co-chairwoman Jantz said that she is still waiting to hear on the location for the

plaque and pedestal and is hoping to have the information this week. She mentioned that it is our centennial project and it will take at least 6 weeks to get the plaque made. She said that Mr. Tice told her a couple of weeks ago that there were some additional issues on where it was going to be placed.

Co-chairwoman Jantz said that she is going to the Coffee on the Corner meeting tomorrow morning to talk to them to see if she can get any information. She said that the money is raised and she sent out an update letter to let the people who donated know what is going on and why the plaque and pedestal was not at the Mayor's Downtown party.

Chairwoman Abdallah asked for questions or comments.

B. "Original Townsite" print project update

Co-chairwoman Jantz said that we sold enough maps to pay for the printing costs and all monies received in the future will be for the historic plaque fund. She asked the members if any of them would like some of the maps to sell. She said she has been in contact with the people who made the larger contributions to let them have the low numbered maps. The first 250 copies will be numbered and will have the Centennial Logo and be marked as Limited Editions. She is just about finished with this. She explained that only one of the downtown merchants have the maps to sell.

She said that she spoke to Diane Archer and was told that she is willing to sell them in the Finance Department. Co-chairwoman Jantz said that she has one framed and ready to hang.

C. "Endangered Signs" Discussion

Co-chairwoman Jantz said that she has not heard back from the lady at the Boots and Saddle Motel. She has some information to give her and is going to offer to help her prepare the documents.

Co-chairwoman Jantz said that she had nothing new to report. She mentioned that at last month's meeting Mr. Metz had said that he also had some ideas. Mr. Metz said that he talked with Mr. Tice and he thought putting together some baseline information would be a place to start. He said that we currently have some of this information, but that creating an inventory with photos and dates would be a good first step. He recommended gathering all of the information and putting it into a document.

Mr. Metz also talked about any elements currently in the code that would prevent these signs from remaining. We might need to start tweaking the code to allow these specific signs to remain. Mr. Metz said that one issue Mr. Tice brought up is expired signs, where the use attributed has now gone away. We currently have a provision that these are now in violation and we might want to address this.

Co-chairwoman Jantz asked Mr. Metz if she can get together with him to get started on the first step.

IV. New Business:

- A.** DSA-12-00090: Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 14 original wood windows with new vinyl windows at the First Baptist Church (c. 1938), NWC of 8th St. and Olive Ave.

Mr. Metz did a presentation for the commission on the windows that were replaced. He explained that in May 2012, City Staff was contacted by a representative of the church regarding their desire to replace the windows. In June, he visited the site to review the existing wood windows. He said that he took pictures of the windows at this visit. He advised them, at this time, that they would need to get a Certificate of Appropriateness in order to replace the windows. He explained to them that the process would be to explore repairing the existing windows and if this is not feasible, then to replace with in kind, similar, if not matching material and design. He also told them that if that is not possible, then to request a different material. Mr. Metz said that this was his recommendation at the time. He gave them the application form. Mr. Metz advised them at the time that having this information would help if they were to request a different material when they presented their case to the HPC Commission. Mr. Metz said that in September he was notified that they were in process of replacing the windows and they were cited to stop the work. They finished the job but they were cited to come in and apply for the Certificate of Appropriateness. This is what the commission had before them tonight.

Mr. Metz went over the review criteria for the Certificate of Appropriateness. In summary, he finds that while the vinyl material of the new windows does not match the original material, nor do they match any of the other historic properties around Casa Grande, typically wood or steel, this type is found at several historic properties. He said that their presence has not kept properties from being deemed ineligible on the historic register. He talked about recently they had approved windows to be replaced with vinyl clad as long as they tried to replace with a similar look. He said that even though he would have made some additional recommendations, he said that he thinks historic character is maintained. Mr. Metz said that given the situation, he is recommending that the request be approved. He asked for questions or comments.

Co-chairwoman Jantz talked about the letter that was dated October 4, 2012 from the pastor of the church. She questioned whether the pastor had spoken with the Historical Society or was his conversations with Mr. Metz. Mr. Metz said his understanding was that he is relatively new to the church and that he never spoke to him prior to him submitting the application. Mr. Metz said he was not at meeting in June. He said that he got the impression that this is the account he

had been told. Mr. Metz said that it is pretty common to mistake the Historical Society with the City's Historic Preservation Staff. Co-chairwoman Jantz asked if this was the same pastor as when they had previously approved the cross on top of the church. Mr. Metz did not believe so since this Pastor is newer to the Church. Co-chairwoman Jantz talked about the application and said that there were no quotes submitted. Mr. Metz said that he had asked them previously and was told that they explored the wood windows but they were too costly. Co-chairwoman Jantz said the process would have been a lot easier for the members if they would have done this the correct way. Co-chairwoman Jantz asked if they are now going to change out the front windows (not a part of the current request) or if they can they be put on notice that they need to abide by the regulations. Mr. Metz said that he believes that they are now aware of the process.

Member Poor asked about sign in front of the church and if they aware that they need to contact the city in the future if they decide to change it? Mr. Metz informed them that he was not aware but approval would need to be granted prior to that happening.

Member Blatt asked for future reference if it is possible to get a wood grain texture type vinyl that would be more in line with the requirements. Mr. Metz said it could have been explored.

Co-chairwoman Jantz recommended to Mr. Metz that he send a letter to the pastor of the church regarding any future changes to notify the city.

Mr. Metz said that a representative from the church was at the meeting and asked if any of the members had any questions for her. The representative's name was Leanna Gee, 222 E. 8th St. She spoke to the members briefly.

Chairwoman Abdallah asked for questions or comments. Co-chairwoman Jantz said that prior to May and June someone from the church went to a window person here in town and talked to them about replacing the windows and was told to see Mr. Metz. She does not believe this happened. She understands they did the best they could and what they could afford, but the procedures had not been followed.

Member Trulove made the motion to approve DSA-12-00090: Certificate of Appropriateness to replace 14 original wood windows with new vinyl windows at the First Baptist Church (c. 1938), NWC of 8th St. and Olive Ave. Member Blatt seconded the motion.

The following roll call vote was recorded:

Chairwoman Abdallah:	Nay
Member Blatt:	Aye
Member Goff:	Nay
Co-chairwoman Jantz:	Nay

Member Poor
Member Trulove:

Nay
Aye

The motion failed 4-2

Mr. Metz said that they would now be in violation and asked what the commission would recommend them do to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness. Chairwoman Abdallah said that she would like to see some alterations to the exterior to make the windows more historic. Mr. Metz said one possible solution might be exterior mounted grids that could be applied. Co-chairwoman Jantz asked if there is such a thing. Chairwoman Abdallah talked about doing a false sill. Mr. Metz said they will have to redo the bottom portion of window to do the false sills. Co-chairwoman Jantz said that she is not asking for the windows to be removed but would like to see a quote for what it would have cost for the repairs and if there is now something they can do to enhance them. Chairwoman Abdallah agreed. Mr. Metz explained that this could help a financial hardship case if they had a comparative analysis as to what there is now and an optimally matching wood material.

Mr. Metz explained to the applicant that they could begin the appeal procedure. The appeal needs to be done within 15 days to the city. They would need to submit a letter requesting appeal to the city council for consideration of the Historic Preservation Commission action. Mr. Metz said this would be first action to take or to resubmit with the changes being proposed. *(NOTE: upon further review of the code, this is not the accurate appeal process and the applicant will be notified and advised of the correct course of action, which involves a hardship application)*

There was some discussion on whether they would be eligible for the tax break. Mr. Metz said that he did not know if a church is exempt from property taxes.

Mr. Metz said he consulted with SHPO on this case to see what their thoughts were. He said it does not look like this is something that would automatically remove the property from the historic register. He said that windows are critical to the structure but the material itself has not kept a property from being listed. Mr. Metz said it would need to be a combination of things that would remove a property from list.

Chairwoman Abdallah asked a question about one of the photos in their packet. She said that there was an arched window that was no longer there. Mr. Metz did not know about it. Chairwoman Abdallah pointed out that there previously have been some changes made.

Co-chairwoman Jantz explained the process the previous pastor went through to get this property listed on the historic register.

Mr. Metz asked for any other suggestions from the members in the event an appeal to the city council is not successful and they need to come back and

present to the HPC commission. Chairwoman Abdallah commented on the importance of coming to the commission prior to doing any future changes. She also talked about the importance of our historic buildings.

Mr. Metz explained to the commission that they have been cited and that there are potential penalties.

V. Reports:

A. Evergreen District/Historic Properties monitoring

Co-chairwoman Jantz mentioned a house on Kadota that is building a fence around their front yard. Mr. Metz said he will look into it.

VI. Public Comments:

Co-chairwoman Jantz asked Mr. Metz if he got permission from Mr. Tice to call the owner of the Sunset Court to try to get the sign. Mr. Metz said that he did get permission from Mr. Tice. Co-chairwoman Jantz said she will contact him to get the phone number.

Mr. Metz introduced Mrs. Blakeman and informed the members that he will be leaving the city and that she will be taking over the Historic Preservation Commission.

VII. Adjournment:

Chairwoman Abdallah called for adjournment at 6:48 p.m.

Submitted this **25th day of March 2013** by Laura Blakeman, Ex Officio Member of the Casa Grande Historic Preservation Commission, subject to the Commission's approval.

Approved this ____ day of _____, 2013, by the Casa Grande Historic Preservation Commission.

Chairperson Abdallah