

Regular Meeting
November 23, 2015

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE CASA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION HELD ON MONDAY, NOVEMBER 23, 2015, AT 6:00 P.M. IN CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 510 E. FLORENCE BOULEVARD, CASA GRANDE, ARIZONA.

I. Call to Order:

Chairwoman Jantz called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

II. Roll Call:

Jantz, Marge Chairwoman
Rooney, Susan Member
Benedict, Brett Member
South, Joyce Member

Absent:

Trulove, Clara Co-Chairwoman (Excused)

City Staff Present:

Laura Blakeman-City Planner
Linda Harris-Administrative Assistant

III. Approval of Minutes:

October 26, 2015

Member Benedict moved to approve the minutes from October 26, 2015 with the requested correction. Motion was seconded by Member Rooney. All were in favor. Motion passed 4-0.

IV. Presentations:

Mrs. Blakeman introduced the new Historic Preservation Commission member Kehinde Victoria Lawal. Member Lawal expressed her personal interest in the historic preservation field.

Staff explained that Member Lawal was in the audience tonight observing the Commission and will officially be serving with the Commission at the next meeting.

V. New Business:

A. Request by Janiece M. Grappe, 1129 N. Lehmborg Avenue, Casa Grande, AZ 85122, for the following request:

1. DSA-15-00131: Certificate of Appropriateness to repair/replace windows, replace the concrete front porch/driveway and add a walkway connecting the driveway to the front entry located at 1129 N. Lehmberg Avenue, a contributing property located within the Evergreen First Addition Historic District.*

Laura Blakeman, Planner came forward and presented a brief overview of the case as detailed in the staff report. The Certificate of Appropriateness request involves:

1. Replacement of two bedroom windows (facing Lehmberg Avenue)
2. Replacement of the windows at the front porch entry
3. Remove and replace the driveway and carport area and the front porch.
4. A new 4 foot wide walkway will be added to connect the driveway/carport to the front entry of the house.

Mrs. Blakeman explained that the two bedroom windows located on each side of the front porch are steel casement windows that are proposed to be replaced with vinyl sliding double glazed Low-E thermal break windows. The new windows will match the existing style incorporating window grids.

The windows on the front porch are single pane picture windows that are being replaced with dual pane Low-E, thermal break glazing. All windows will be tempered except for the top five window panes. As part of the window replacements, the wood frame, sash and trim will be replaced and will be painted to match the existing color.

Mrs. Blakeman overviewed the review criteria which are detailed in the staff report. She stated that the majority of the facade facing Lehmberg Ave. will remain untouched. The window replacements will have the same visual aspect from the street. The proposed repairs will be compatible with the property's historic character by maintaining the original window frame openings as well as keeping the brick sills. Mrs. Blakeman stated that the walkway connection being added will have minimal impact on the property. The proposed materials represent the same style and compatible colors of the homes within the historic neighborhood. The proposed windows will be compatible to what existed and Staff believes the applicant has attempted to address the historical integrity of the home by replacing the architectural features similar to the architectural style of the home. In addition, the proposed changes involve replacing the deteriorated features of the house in regards to the wood frame surrounding the windows.

Mrs. Blakeman stated that the State Historic Preservation Office is in agreement with City Staff's determination. Their finding is that "no historic property is being affected".

Mrs. Blakeman stated that staff recommends the Historic Preservation Commission approve DSA-15-00131 Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition as written in the staff report. She stated that the applicant was not in attendance and asked for questions or comments.

Chairwoman Jantz commented that this project is being funded through a CDBG

grant. She questioned how the applicant found out about this CDBG funding as this might be an option for other homes in the historic district.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that she was not sure but she believes that in the past, the property owner received some assistance through CDBG funds and is therefore familiar with the process.

Chairman Jantz questioned if there has been a contractor chosen yet.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that the Housing Division is in charge of the rehab project and if the Certificate of Appropriateness is approved, there will be a bidding process to determine the contractor.

Chairwoman Jantz asked Mrs. Blakeman if the Housing Division will be monitoring the repairs to make sure that there are no changes to the plans. She also asked if the screens will be on the outside or the inside of the windows when they are replaced.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that the exterior window screens were not part of the scope of work but wanted to point out that the existing windows are currently welded shut and deteriorating

Chairwoman Jantz stated that she would recommend the screens be on the inside if possible.

Chairwoman Jantz questioned if the new ^{porch} windows will have window coverings.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that a condition could be added to the approval to put the screens on the inside if possible, if the Commission's concern is that the view of the new windows will be hidden from the street.

Chairwoman Jantz questioned if the front screen door is going to be replaced with a door that looks exactly like the existing door.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that she did not see the front door screen in the scope of work. Part of the scope of work is to replace the wood trim around the windows and doors as necessary.

Member Benedict suggested that a condition of approval be added to address the screen door.

Member Benedict questioned if the front windows being replaced will look like the windows that are currently there.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that the center windows at the front entry will be replaced with dual pane windows. In addition the wood frame, sash and trim will be replaced. The look of the windows will remain the same.

Member Benedict questioned if the top windows are being replaced.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that the top (5) windows will be replaced but will not have the thermal break glazing.

Member Benedict made a motion to approve DSA-15-00131 Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions:

1. The new window frames shall be brown in color to match the previous window frames.
2. If exterior window screens are installed, the screens shall not be opaque.
3. The front screen door (facing Lehmberg Avenue) shall be maintained.

Motion was seconded by Member Rooney. All were in favor. Motion passed 4-0.

B. Historic Preservation Website links

Mrs. Blakeman stated that the first addition newsletter and information on the grant has now been posted on the City's website.

C. Historic Property Monitoring areas

Chairwoman Jantz stated that there is one house that is for sale in Co-Chairwoman Trulove's monitoring area. She will contact Member Trulove or she can contact the realtor to give them a copy of the newsletter.

D. Evergreen Historic Properties Monitoring

Chairwoman Jantz stated that she has revised the monitoring zone map to include the new commission member. She divided one of the zones so that there are 6 zones total and she will take one additional zone until a new commission member is appointed.

Mr. Blakeman replied that she will make changes to the monitoring zone map and the updated map will be in the packet for the next meeting.

Member South questioned if a security door is permitted because she has a home in her monitoring area that recently installed one.

Mrs. Blakeman stated that staff will do some research and this can be brought back to the next meeting for discussion.

There was a discussion on house at 1100 N. Lehmberg which was up for sale and has now been sold. The owners have put turf in and have installed a security door. Chairwoman Jantz stated that she previously requested that staff send the property owner a letter notifying them that they are in a historic district and any work other than maintenance needs to be approved by the commission.

Member South stated that the historical information was given to the owners of 1100 N. Lehmberg by the realty company when they purchased the house.

Chairwoman Jantz stated that landscaping will be included in the new ordinance as part of the exterior changes. She commented that the public is not aware of this

being in the ordinance.

Member Rooney commented that the property owner should have applied for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the storm door.

Chairwoman Jantz agreed.

Chairwoman Jantz stated that the owners at 1105 N. Gilbert Ave. are replacing the shingles on their house. She asked Mrs. Blakeman if they contacted the city for a Certificate of No Effect. She talked to the roofers and was told that they will be replacing the shingles with the same light gray color.

Mrs. Blakeman will check to see if they have submitted for the Certificate of No Effect.

Chairwoman Jantz reported that the car is still parked in the yard at 1017 N. Kadota. She stated that the license plate expired in June 2013. The car has been parked there for at least a month.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that she will give this information to Code Enforcement for action.

Member South asked if there was an update on the residence with the decorative fence that appears to be blocking site visibility at 1000 N. Lehmborg Avenue.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that she had nothing to report and that staff is still researching the issue.

Chairwoman Jantz asked if the two commission members were able to meet to discuss the items for the possible survey to be put in the 2nd Addition Newsletter.

Member South stated that she still needs to meet with Member Rooney. There was a discussion on items to be included in the survey and whether the survey can be mailed or completed on-line. Mrs. Blakeman recommended mailing out the surveys.

Member Benedict suggested asking the City Council to fund the historic plaques for the contributors in the Evergreen Historic District. There was a brief discussion on number of houses in the district that are contributors and the costs involved.

Mrs. Blakeman stated that this item will be put on the next agenda for discussion.

Chairwoman Jantz replied that she will provide the number of contributors to the Evergreen Historic District for the next meeting.

Chairwoman Jantz stated that currently in the plaque and pedestal fund and the historic maps there is a balance of \$1082.89. This money is for the history plaques in the downtown area.

E. December 28th meeting

Mrs. Blakeman asked if the commission if they would like to cancel the December meeting, because it falls on the Monday after the Christmas holiday and there will be several staff and commissioners on vacation.

Chairman Jantz expressed her concern with a delay in getting the 2nd addition newsletter together and the Pass-Through Grant if the meeting is pushed to January.

Mrs. Blakeman stated that it was discussed and agreed by the Commission at the last meeting for the commission to move forward with the 2nd newsletter.

Chairwoman Jantz requested that this item be moved to the end of the meeting after further discussion on the Pass-Through Grant and the 2nd Addition Newsletter.

After discussion of the Evergreen 2nd Addition newsletter, Chairwoman Jantz and the Commission agreed to cancel the December 28, 2015 meeting.

VI. Call to the Public:

There were no comments from the public.

VII. Report by Officers:

A. Historic Preservation Ordinance/Bylaws

Mrs. Blakeman reported that staff is continuing to work on the ordinance and bylaws. She stated that it will be the first part of 2016 before this will be brought to the commission for their review.

B. Request for Proposals - Federal Fiscal Year 2015 Certified Local Government Pass-Through Grant regarding Nomination Preparation for designating local landmarks – "Signs"

Mrs. Blakeman updated the commission on the status of the Request for Proposals. She stated that staff is still working on the proposals and she will keep the commission updated.

C. 806 N. Brown – Appeal Decision (Evergreen Contributor)

Mrs. Blakeman reported that the City Council approved the hardship appeal for 806 N. Brown. She explained that the council could only consider the economic hardship.

Mrs. Blakeman further explained that one of the changes to the ordinance is the removal of the hardship step that comes back to the Commission after the Certificate of Appropriateness is denied. According to the verbiage of the new Ordinance, after a Certificate of Appropriateness is denied by the Commission the appeal will be heard by the City Council.

Chairwoman Jantz asked if there was a timeline as to when house will be painted.

Mrs. Blakeman replied that a Certificate of No Effect was approved to paint the house, but a timeline was not added as a stipulation of approval. She will contact the homeowner to find out when she plans to paint.

D. Meeting schedule for 2016*

Included in the commission member's packet was the meeting schedule for 2016.

E. New Member List*

Included in the commission member's packet was the updated member list.

VIII. Adjournment:

Chairwoman Jantz called for adjournment at 7:20 p.m.

Submitted this **14th day of December 2015**, by Linda Harris, Administrative Assistant to the Historic Preservation Commission, subject to the Commission's approval.

Approved this 25 day of Jan, 2016, by the Casa Grande Historic Preservation Commission.


Chairwoman Jantz