

Regular Meeting  
March 23, 2015

**MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE CASA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION HELD ON MONDAY, MARCH 23, 2015, AT 6:00 P.M. IN CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 510 E. FLORENCE BOULEVARD, CASA GRANDE, ARIZONA.**

**I. Call to Order:**

Chairwoman Jantz called the meeting to order at 6:07 p.m.

**II. Roll Call:**

Rooney, Susan Member  
Poor, Tom Member  
Trulove, Clara Co-Chairwoman  
Jantz, Marge Chairwoman

**Absent:**

Benedict, Brett Member (unexcused)

**City Staff Present:**

Jim Gagliardi-City Planner  
Linda Harris-Development Center Secretary

**III. Approval of Minutes:**

February 23, 2015

Co-chairwoman Trulove moved to approve the minutes dated February 23, 2015 with requested corrections. Motion was seconded by Member Rooney. All were in favor. Motion passed 4-0.

**IV. Presentations:**

None

**V. Unfinished Business:**

**A. 515 E. 3rd Street – Stone Bungalow (Local and National Register)**

Chairwoman Jantz stated that property owners submitted color samples, which were emailed to the commission for their review.

Chairwoman Jantz said that she went to paint store and got the color samples and stopped by the property to take some pictures. After a brief discussion, it was felt that the brown color was going to be too dark and it was suggested that the color should be the gray color of the screen door or lighter, which would also match the rock.

Chairwoman Jantz asked if the owners will be painting the 6 foot fence, which has two colors. Mr. Gagliardi responded that he did not know.

Chairwoman Jantz stated that if owners would still like a recommendation as to paint color, the commission would recommend the same color as screen door.

**B. Historic Preservation Design Guidelines – Evergreen Historic District\***

Chairwoman Jantz noted that the guidelines have been reviewed and questioned Mr. Gagliardi what the next step would be in getting the guidelines approved and posted on the website.

Mr. Gagliardi stated that he believed the commission would vote to approve the guidelines and they would be sent to the webmaster to have posted on the website. There was a discussion as to whether the guidelines would need to go to council for approval.

Mr. Gagliardi stated that if it is determined that the guidelines will need to go to council for approval, the commission's motion to approve would be sent to council with Staff's recommendation to approve the guidelines.

Motion was made by Member Rooney to approve the revised copy of the Design Guidelines dated March 11, 2015. Motion was seconded by Co-chairwoman Trulove. All were in favor. Motion passed 4-0.

**C. Pass Through Grant**

Chairwoman Jantz noted that staff has not received the application to apply for the Pass Through Grant. She stated that she spoke to Eric Vondy from SHPO regarding the application and was told that congress voted to continue the funding for 2015 and the maximum amount of grant money available has been increased from \$10,000.00 to \$20,000.00. She mentioned the state submitted their paperwork, which has been misplaced and they are resubmitting so they were not sure when the applications would be sent out.

Chairwoman Jantz questioned if a motion should be made tonight to

move forward with applying for the grant in the event the application comes in and there is a short deadline to apply for the grant.

Motion was made by Member Rooney to move forward with applying for the grant. Motion was seconded by Member Poor. All were in favor. Motion passed 4-0.

**D. Historic Preservation Ordinance\***

Chairwoman Jantz stated that corrections discussed at the February 23, 2015 meeting have been made to the ordinance. She said that there were two things, which were not in ordinance that she wanted to mention. The first item being there is no provision that talks about the destruction of property by fire or other means and a timeline to reconstruct. The second issue not in the ordinance is de-listing a property. Mr. Gagliardi stated that due to Proposition 207, the City cannot impose a timeline to reconstruct or require reconstruction. The property would be required to be made secure and safe. Chairwoman Jantz questioned if something could be put in the ordinance. Mr. Gagliardi responded that nothing could be put in ordinance.

Mr. Gagliardi noted that his recommendation tonight would be for the commission to table this item to the next meeting for further discussion before making motion to approve the ordinance. He further mentioned that the current ordinance does not include steps on how to de-list a property from the historic register. He said that from talking to SHPO, in order to de-list a property there has to be specific criteria and by tabling this item would allow staff to work with the commission in suggesting some criteria.

Motion was made by Member Rooney to table item to the next meeting to determine what kind of criteria is needed to de-list a property. Motion was seconded by Member Poor. All were in favor. Motion passed 4-0.

**E. Evergreen Addition Marketing Piece\***

Chairwoman Jantz stated the Marketing Piece has been updated to include the corrections previously discussed and that it looks great. She said the marketing piece will consist of 5 pages and suggested that it be folded in half and mentioned doing a mailing. Chairwoman Jantz said that the map showing if a property is a contributor or non-contributor was not in the packet that was discussed at the last meeting and she will contact Mrs. Blakeman regarding the map.

Chairwoman Jantz stated that she will meet with Mr. Gagliardi to put together the marketing piece for the website. She also requested assistance from staff to do a spreadsheet that would be in addition to the marketing piece showing what would be required from the city for a permit if in a historic district or a homeowners association or a conventional neighborhood.

Member Rooney moved to approve the marketing piece and requested this item be put on next month's agenda. Motion was seconded by Co-chairwoman Trulove. All were in favor. Motion passed 4-0.

**F. Nominate Shonessy House to Arizona's Most endangered properties list (Local and National Register)**

Chairwoman Jantz stated that she spoke to Jim McPherson from SHPO and was told that they are changing the requirements to nominate a property. He asked her to resubmit the request. Chairwoman Jantz noted that request has been submitted to them and she copied Mrs. Blakeman on the request.

**G. Sunset Court Sign**

Chairwoman Jantz asked Member Poor if the sign has been cleaned up. Member Poor replied that it was. Chairwoman Jantz mentioned that during a previous visit to the North Operations Center, it was decided there is not room to store the sign, but there was a possibility that the sign could be stored at the South Operation Center. Chairwoman Jantz said she will contact Mrs. Blakeman when she returns to see if the City can have the sign picked up and stored for now.

**H. Local Landmarks – Signs**

Chairwoman Jantz mentioned that she has not received a copy of a letter which she had requested from the Mesa Preservation Foundation. When she followed up on letter, she was informed that letter has not been created, but as soon as it is, a copy will be provided to her.

Chairwoman Jantz stated that she went to visit the new owner of the Cruz Trading Post and was informed that the sign has been taken down and given away. She also stated that the Dairy Queen is going to re-open and they are going to put her in contact with the new owner so that a letter can be put in the file regarding their sign.

I. 222 E. 8th Street – First Baptist Church – Turf (Local and National Register)

Mr. Gagliardi stated that staff has not yet received a response from the church regarding the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the landscaping. He noted that the next step will be a Code Enforcement letter sent to them. Chairwoman Jantz requested that this item be put on the next agenda for an update.

J. 1017 N. Kadota – Carport Addition (Evergreen Contributor)

Mr. Gagliardi stated that staff has not received a response from owner regarding the carport addition. He noted that the next step will be a Code Enforcement letter sent to them. He said that this will be put on the next agenda for an update.

**VI. New Business:**

A. Hardship request for Primera Iglesia Bautista – 305 E. 4<sup>th</sup> Street (Local and National Register)

Chairwoman Jantz stated that applicant was not in audience and questioned Mr. Gagliardi if applicant would like them to proceed with what information the commission has in their packets.

Mr. Gagliardi covered the hardship request and said staff had previously recommended approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of the shingle roof with metal and the commission denied the request at the last meeting. This request is the hardship request, which allows the applicant to explain the reasons for the hardship. If this hardship request is denied by the commission, then the next step for the applicant would be to appeal to the council. Mr. Gagliardi said that without the applicant at the meeting, it is the choice of the commission to make their decision on the hardship.

Chairwoman Jantz stated that in the packet the applicant has indicated in the event the hardship request is denied, he would like to withdraw the building from the historic register.

Chairwoman Jantz noted that she contacted Jim Garrison at SHPO to get another opinion and was told that it is their position that a roof does wear out and they would be allowed to replace with another compatible roof. Mr. Garrison mentioned that maybe the metal roof could match the color of the roof being replaced.

Chairwoman Jantz asked for further discussion or a motion to approve the hardship request.

Co-chairwoman Trulove stated that applicant is trying to preserve the building.

Mr. Gagliardi stated that without having criteria for de-list; at this time the applicant's option would be to apply for the appeal. If they chose not to appeal and proceed with the de-list process, then it would be part of the de-list criteria that has yet to be created.

Chairwoman Jantz questioned if this item could be tabled until the commission receives information on the de-list process. Mr. Gagliardi responded that there is nothing in the code that allows an item to be tabled and that a motion would need to be made to approve or deny the request.

Motion was made by Co-chairwoman Trulove to approve the Hardship request. Motion was seconded by Member Rooney.

The following roll call vote was recorded:

Member Rooney	No
Member Poor	No
Co-Chairwoman Trulove	Aye
Chairwoman Jantz	No

The motion failed 1-3.

Reasons cited were that the metal roof takes away from the historic integrity of the property. If a metal roof was to be considered it needed to be gray, the same color as the existing shingles. The applicant had already purchased green metal.

**B. Certificate of Appropriateness – 601 N. Cameron (Local and National Register)**

Chairwoman Jantz asked applicant to come to podium.

Ronald Eggers, applicant, came forward and addressed the commission. He said that they have been trying to stay as close to the original building as possible.

Mr. Gagliardi presented the case. He said the request is for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior changes to the Casa Grande Hospital site. The changes are primarily to the doors and

windows. Mr. Gagliardi stated that the historic inventory taken in 1997 did not specify which windows and doors are true to the building. The hospital was constructed in 1928. Mr. Gagliardi said per the applicant, the doors and windows proposed to be replaced are not original. Mr. Gagliardi noted that SHPO found that the proposed changes do not warrant de-listing from the national historic register.

Chairwoman Jantz talked about the changes that have been made. She mentioned the porch that was removed and the different types and sizes of the windows that have been replaced. She commented that the changes are very nice but the property no longer resembles the original look of the hospital. Mr. Eggers explained that they have tried to stay with original as much as possible. He explained that the porch was removed because of its deterioration, which made it unsafe.

Mr. Gagliardi stated the staff is recommending approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness.

Chairwoman Jantz commented that 16 months ago the work started and this is the first time this has come before the commission. She also noted that at the last meeting the commission voted to consider de-listing the property (currently there is no de-listing process in place).

Chairwoman Jantz asked Mr. Eggers if the property owner would consider splitting the cost and doing a history plaque, which would have information on the hospital. Mr. Eggers replied that he would have to talk to owner, but he believes this will not be a problem. After further discussion, Chairwoman Jantz asked for a motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the following conditions: Any further exterior work would come before the commission and a history plaque would be placed on the hospital site.

Co-chairwoman Trulove made motion to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness with the condition that if any further exterior changes are made, this will come before the commission and a historic plaque be placed at the site. Motion was seconded by Member Rooney. All were in favor. Motion passed 4-0.

**C. Historic Property Monitoring areas**

Nothing new was reported

**D. Evergreen Historic Properties Monitoring**

Co-Chairwoman Trulove asked for an update on the awning that

was removed at the Casa Grande Garage at 117 N. Sacaton St. There was a brief discussion regarding the awning that was not on the historic building in 1932, but was attached to the building when it was surveyed by SHPO in 1998.

Chairwoman Jantz asked if staff could send the property owner another letter asking them to make repairs to the building to bring the building into compliance with the way it looked on the historic register, which is to stucco and paint.

**E. De-listing properties discussion**

Chairwoman Jantz mentioned that this was discussed earlier in the meeting and staff will be working on criteria to de-list a property on the local register. She asked if this could be put on next month's agenda for further discussion.

**VII. Call to the Public:**

None

**VIII. Report by Officers:**

**A. Historic Preservation Commission Vacancies**

Chairwoman Jantz stated that a new commission member has been selected. She has not been sworn in yet and will be attending the next meeting. Her name is Joyce South. She lives in the Evergreen District and is a realtor who will be replacing Member Bridwell, who also was a realtor.

Chairwoman Jantz said that there is currently one additional opening to replace Member Hodson, who recently submitted his resignation letter.

**B. Historic Preservation Conference – May 13 – 15, 2015, Flagstaff Arizona**

Chairwoman Jantz said there will be two members attending the Historic Preservation Conference and they have received confirmation that they are registered for the conference.

Mr. Gagliardi stated that he will be attending the conference as well, as Mrs. Blakeman.

**IX. Adjournment:**

Submitted this **6<sup>th</sup> day of April 2015**, by Linda Harris, Secretary to the Historic Preservation Commission, subject to the Commission's approval.

Approved this 27 day of April, 2015, by the Casa Grande Historic Preservation Commission.

  
Chairwoman Jantz