

AGENDA ITEM _____
DATE _____

Regular Meeting
August 26, 2013

MINUTES OF A REGULAR MEETING OF THE CASA GRANDE HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION HELD ON MONDAY, AUGUST 26, 2013 AT 6:00 P.M. IN CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 510 E. FLORENCE BOULEVARD, CASA GRANDE, ARIZONA.

I. Call to Order:

Co-chairwoman Jantz called the meeting to order at 6:07 p.m.

II. Roll Call:

Jantz, Marge, Co-Chairwoman
Goff, Warren, Member
Hodson, Kenneth, Member
Poor, Thomas, Acting Chairman
Trulove, Clara, Member

Absent

City Staff Present

Laura Blakeman, City Planner
Jim Gagliardi, City Planner
Linda Harris, Development Center Secretary

III. Approval of Minutes:

July 22, 2013

Co-chairwoman Jantz asked for approval of the minutes from July 22, 2013. All were in favor. None were opposed.

IV. New Business:

A. Request by Jennifer Deall, 112 N. Sacaton, Casa Grande AZ 85122, for the following request:

1. DSA-13-00106: Certificate of Appropriateness to place an office building, storage building and outdoor seating area located at 112 N.

Sacaton for the Angels in Waiting Mortuary located adjacent to two historic buildings listed on the National and Local registers.

The applicant is requesting the proposed modifications to the property:

- 1) Move existing fence back 20 feet from the front of the property to back at the rear of the 12'X32' "office" building.
- 2) Paint existing permanent building (mortuary) to a brown color with rust trim to match the new portable building.
- 3) Add electric to 1 of 2 new portable buildings (power source will not be visible)
- 4) Add a 10'X20' courtyard seating area between the new portable building and adjacent building (storage building) with a mixture of native plants, rocks and cement structures.
- 5) The "office" will be relocated to the new portable building.

Mrs. Blakeman gave a brief history of the site. The applicant has placed a building (12'X12') and a storage shed (8'X10') between two historic buildings that are listed on the Local and National historic registers located at 112 N. Sacaton Street (currently used for Angels in Waiting Mortuary and Crematory) and 118 N. Sacaton Street (currently used as Stephani's Pooch Parlor). The applicant is proposing to use the 12' X12' building as an office for Angels in Waiting Mortuary and the storage building (8' X 10') is proposed as an accessory building to the mortuary. The applicant was cited by Code Enforcement on June 4, 2013 for placing the building on the property without the appropriate approvals (building use determination, zoning approvals, permits, etc). The applicant is also proposing an outdoor landscaped seating area adjacent to the proposed buildings.

Mrs. Blakeman covered the review criteria used in staff's determination for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Staff believes that these buildings have a major impact on the historic character of the area and the proposed buildings do not "fit" into the "character" of the area or the lot. The proposed buildings are designed to be used for residential purposes, per <http://www.azportablebuildings.com> web site.

Staff is recommending that the Historic Preservation Commission deny the Certificate of Appropriateness based on lack of compliance with Certificate of Appropriateness review criteria. Mrs. Blakeman asked for questions. There were no questions for staff.

The applicant, Jennifer Deall, came to podium and explained her situation. She said she was originally operating at this location then moved the business to Florence Boulevard and encountered a parking issue. She spoke about moving back to the original building and costs involved. She intended to separate the office from the chapel that she has used for two and a half years. She explained that due to the size of the building, she could possibly have a body within twenty feet of where there might be a visitor entering the front door. She talked about Stephani's Pooch Parlor and explained that when Stephani's lease was up in November, she contemplated moving her office into that building. She said that she decided not to interfere with her business and should would figure it out. Jennifer Deall said that she is willing to work with the city to come up with suggestions as to what she could do to resolve the issues. She further explained that she did her research according to what was suggested from the city as to the design characters. She said that she still needs to change the zoning for additional parking spaces. She explained that the office building would be used for her staff. She would like to be able to put the fence back up to protect the cooler that is outside unprotected and her equipment. She said that she plans to use a downtown landscaper to design the courtyard. She asked the commission for suggestions to be able to get this approved.

Member Poor said that the Commission is not planners.

Member Hodson explained that the Commission is not here to help the applicant design anything. They are here to determine if the proposed buildings and associated request is compatible with the historic value of the downtown and from what he sees it is not. He is not sure how anything can be changed.

Co-chairwoman Jantz said that the request has been brought before the commission and it is their decision to determine whether the request meets the Certificate of Appropriateness criteria. Member Trulove asked if another applicant requested to bring in a building comparable to what is being requested, would it be approved.

Co-chairwoman Jantz explained that the Commission is sympathetic to the fact that she is a small business owner and has moved from the Florence Boulevard location. She said that is it incredible what she has offered the community and her partnership with the Tucson mortuary and that she has been in business for two and a half years, but this is not what is before them tonight.

Co-chairwoman Jantz asked if regardless of the outcome of tonight's meeting, could the fence be put back up. The fence was previously there and was taken down to bring in the portable building. The fence is needed to

protect the coolers that are in the back and her equipment. Mrs. Blakeman said that staff would request that the fence be put back up since it has been there for years.

Co-chairwoman Jantz said that she feels the portable building does not compliment the historic building. She talked about the downtown street improvements and the historic plaques that were put in sidewalks. She asked if building permits were required for the portable building. Mrs. Blakeman said that they would need an occupancy, foundation and electrical permit. Co-chairwoman Jantz asked for public comment.

Co-chairwoman Jantz stated the following:

- The architecture of the portable building is not compatible to the architecture of the commercial buildings.
- The portable building does not complement the adjacent historic buildings.
- Painting the "Angels in Waiting" building to match the portable building does not rectify the situation.

Member Hodson made a motion to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness request. Motion was seconded by Member Poor.

The following roll call vote was recorded:

Member Goff	Aye
Member Hodson	Aye
Member Trulove	No
Member Poor	Aye
Co-chairwoman Jantz	Aye

The motion passed 4 –1.

Mrs. Blakeman informed the applicant that the next step would be to apply for a hardship request. The hardship request would be presented to the Commission and if the Commission denies the hardship request, the applicant can appeal the decision to the City Council within 45 days.

V. Call to the Public:

VI. Report by Officers:

A. Request by Larry Waite, for the following land use approval located at 1129

N Lehmborg Ave, APN 506-09-089A:

1. **DSA 13-00114: Certificate of No Effect** to allow a roof repair on a home contributing to the Evergreen Historic District, but not an individual contributor.

Mr. Gagliardi presented the case. He explained that this was an emergency re-roof situation. The applicant was Larry Waite, who is a city employee representing the owner. Although it was not an individual contributor, the repairs requested appear to be appropriate. He showed pictures of the house before and after the roof was put on and pointed out that the color of the roof material was very close to the original color.

- B. Request by Avis Hanson**, for the following land use approval located at 1132 N. Brown, APN 506-08-115.

1. **DSA-13-00108: Certificate of No Effect** to allow minor repairs on the exterior of a home contributing to the Evergreen Historic District.

Mrs. Blakeman presented the case. She covered the proposed alterations which include minor repairs to the fascia and soffit on the patio cover and storage room, replace the support foundation on the northeast corner which has deteriorated, new lattice to be installed on the porch handrail to retain the overall appearance and the exterior wood trim and fascia to be painted. Mrs. Blakeman said that staff has determined that proposed repairs meet the requirements for the Certificate of No Effect. She also said that they received concurrence with a "No Effect" finding from SHPO because the homeowner is funding assistance thru the housing division. Mrs. Blakeman asked for questions. There were none.

- C. Request by Edward Hernandez**, for the following land use approval located at 109 E. 2nd Street, APN 507-07-144.

1. **DSA-13-00064: Certificate of No Effect** to paint the exterior of Felipe's Cuban Restaurant.

Mrs. Blakeman presented the case which includes painting the exterior of the building. She presented pictures of the building, with the new paint colors. Mrs. Blakeman said that staff has concluded that the minor changes meet the Certificate of No Effect criteria. She asked for questions. There were none.

Co-chairwoman Jantz asked if they have come in for a permit to ~~change~~ *add* the sign. Mrs. Blakeman said that they have not.

from their former location to the side of the building.

D. "Designating Local Landmarks" – Database update

Co-chairwoman Jantz said that she has been working with City Staff getting the sign information entered into the database. She explained that it is about 95 percent completed and she will be submitting it to Mrs. Blakeman in the next few days. She explained that the signs being entered into the database are the ones that were previously identified according to their sign styles, which include ghost sign, endangered signs and non register signs.

E. Evergreen District/Historic Properties monitoring update

Member Goff suggested that the Evergreen District monitoring areas be temporarily updated since there are now members that have resigned. Mrs. Blakeman said that she would work on the reassignments.

Co-chairwoman Jantz updated the members on the house located at 913 N. Morrison Ave. Pat McClaren received a Certificate of Appropriateness in June 2013 to replace the windows. Co-chairwoman Jantz said that the windows have been replaced and that they look awesome.

Member Hodson mentioned the Shonessey house which is part of the "Life on Main" project. He said that he talked to Jim Thompson, the City Manager and he was encouraged at the response he received from him regarding his concern with deterioration. Member Hodson was at city hall last week and spoke with the Mayor, Bob Jackson, and was assured by him. He spoke to Jim Thompson again while he was there and was reassured by him of the City's support in preserving the Shonessey house. Mrs. Blakeman said that she has received word that the roof will be replaced.

Member Hodson talked about the solar panels that are being installed at City Hall. He said that when Mr. Bitter was at the last meeting and explained how the payback is going to happen and it is not going to cost us anything, he did not understand. Member Hodson said that Mr. Bitter again explained this at the council meeting. He also listened to the recording on the City Page and did not understand the concept of the payback. He is still confused on it. He said that when he was in the Development Center, he asked why the solar panels were put in the parking lot and why they were not put on top of one of the buildings such as the Boys and Girls Club or the Parks and Recreation building. He thinks that it has taken away what City Hall stands for and if this had come before him before they were installed, he would have voted "No".

Co-chairwoman Jantz passed around a plaque for the members to see. She explained that this is the first plaque that we purchased with the sale of the Town site maps. The property owner paid for half of the cost. The plaque will be placed on the old Sprouse Reitz building, which is now Merle Norman.

Co-chairwoman Jantz gave a brief update on the "Doors to the Past" project and the Merle Norman building, which was built in 1931 and was the Sprouse Reitz building for ten years. She explained that they have done art work on the side of the building and did brick work on the ^{SIDE AND} back of the building. They uncovered the windows and found the original windows from 1931. Four of the five were in good shape. They found a local person to remake the missing window. The plaque tells the history of Sprouse Reitz and in 2002 the owner of Merle Norman won three Arizona main street awards ^{CASA GRANDE PROGRAM.} for the ~~interior renovations~~. This project is being done by Main Street. There are nine doors going on the building, of which six of the nine are ready to be installed. The doors speak of our history. Co-chairwoman Jantz said one of the original awnings from the Horseshoe Motel will be hung over the back door at Merle Norman's. She said that sometime in October they will schedule a celebration. Mrs. Blakeman asked if Main Street were going to come before the commission with a Certificate of Appropriateness. Co-chairwoman Jantz said that they could.

Member Goff asked for an update on the terms a member can serve. Mrs. Blakeman asked the members if they had received a letter from the City Clerk's office asking them if they wish to continue to serve on the commission as there is no term expiration. She said that if the current members choose to continue to serve on the commission, there will be two vacancies to fill the resignation of Susan Abdallah and David Blatt.

VII. Adjournment:

Co-chairwoman Jantz called for adjournment at 7:23 p.m.

Submitted this **9th day of September 2013** by Linda Harris, Secretary to the Historic Preservation Commission, subject to the Commission's approval.

Approved this 23 day of Sept, 2013, by the Casa Grande Historic Preservation Commission.

Mary Jantz Co-Chair
Chairperson Abdallah